

**The Uptake of Guidelines for Cancer Pain Management
and Its Impact on Nursing Practice in South Korea:
A Critical Ethnography**

MIRAN KIM

MN (Brisbane), Grad Dip (Med-Surge), BN, RN

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Nursing

The University of Newcastle
New South Wales
Australia

September 2018

This research was supported by an Australian Government Research Training
Program (RTP) Scholarship.

STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY

I hereby certify that the work embodied in the thesis is my own work, conducted under normal supervision. The thesis contains no material which had been accepted, or is being examined, for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made. I give consent to the final version of my thesis being made available worldwide when deposited in the University's Digital Repository, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968 and any approved embargo.

(Signed)

Date:

21. 09. 2018

Miran Kim

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

All the glory and praise to my God who has used this journey as a great opportunity to grow me up not only professionally but also personally.

Many people helped me to complete this journey with endless encouragement and support, sharing of ideas and reflections, and their trust and patience, which have been the source of continuing the journey in countless times.

Firstly, I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my supervisors who have been a great team to provide me abundant knowledge and skills for this journey. My principal supervisor, Associate Professor Sarah Yeun-Sim Jeong who helped me with providing resources, showing me how to ask questions to myself and nurturing me during the time of struggle; a co-supervisor, Conjoint Professor Isabel Higgins, who helped me to have various critical eyes to look at the phenomenon by inviting me to her critical thinking process; and the other co-supervisor, Conjoint Professor Margaret McMillan, who invited me to experience this journey, walked with me by sharing experiences and ideas, and encouraged me to reflect and continue this journey. I cannot find the word that could express my gratitude for what they have contributed to this journey and the time they gave me, but the passion, wisdom and patience that they showed me and every coffee we shared with fruitful conversation, they will be remembered with this thesis.

My special thanks goes to Anna Treloar who carefully read the thesis for editing and shared thoughtful comments before finalising the thesis, and Debbie Booth who gave me immediate response in answering questions regarding the use of EndNote.

My sincere thanks go to the nurses who were willingly participate the study, shared their experiences and struggles honestly to the stranger in caring those patients with cancer. Without your honest sharing, I would not have been able to experience this wonderful journey and have better understanding about nursing in Korea, despite my own experience of working as a RN.

My beloved family, Mum and Dad, my two sisters, my brother-in-law and two nephews, they make me stay strong in every challenging time and situation, and become who I supposed to be. Despite the physical distance, they are always with me through the whole journey.

Finally, my dear friends who have shared this journey with me by showing their love and kindness in various ways such as providing shelters, including me in their prayers, and sharing their part of life with me, although I cannot list all their names here, their love and kindness cannot be forgotten.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY	i
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	ii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	iii
Abbreviations	ix
Key to transcripts	xi
ABSTRACT	xii
CHAPTER ONE	
INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1. Background of the Study.....	1
1.2. The Aims of the Study.....	2
1.3. Cancer and Cancer Pain.....	2
1.3.1. Prevalence of cancer and cancer pain.....	2
1.3.2. Definition of cancer pain.....	6
1.3.3. Meaning of cancer pain and impact of cancer pain experiences for patients.....	6
1.4. Nursing Practice in Managing Cancer Pain: Evidence-Based Practice (EBP), EBGs and CPMG.....	11
1.5. Significance of the Study.....	13
Conclusion.....	14
CHAPTER TWO	
A CRITICAL REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE.....	16
Introduction.....	16
2.1. Background.....	16
2.2. Appraisal of Guidelines for Cancer Pain Management: International Guidelines and the CPMG.....	17
2.3. Literature Review: Nursing Practice in Managing Pain among Patients with Cancer.....	23
2.3.1. Literature search and selection process.....	23
2.3.2. Evaluation of the literature identified.....	26
2.3.3. Analysis and synthesis of the literature.....	26
2.3.4. The findings from the literature.....	27
2.3.4.1. Nurses' perceptions on cancer pain and its management...	27
2.3.4.2. Interlinked knowledge about/attitudes towards/performance of cancer pain management.....	28
2.3.4.3. Evidence-based nursing practice for cancer pain management.....	30
Conclusion.....	31

CHAPTER THREE

METHODOLOGY, DESIGN AND METHODS..... 33

Introduction 33

3.1. The Aims of the Study 34

3.2. The Research Questions 34

3.3. Critical Theory (CT)..... 35

3.3.1. History and tenets of CT 35

3.3.2. Power/knowledge 36

3.3.3. Disciplinary power 38

3.4. Critical Ethnography (CE) 40

3.5. Study Assumptions 44

3.6. Conceptual Framework 45

3.6.1. The innovation 46

3.6.2. Adoption 48

3.6.3. Assimilation: Dissemination and diffusion..... 48

3.6.4. Inner context..... 50

3.6.5. Outer context 51

3.7. Research Design and Methods..... 51

3.7.1. Research setting..... 51

3.7.1.1. Healthcare delivery system in South Korea 51

3.7.1.2. Acute healthcare system, the research site 52

3.7.1.3. Selection criteria of participants 54

3.7.1.4. Entering the field and recruitment of the participants 55

3.7.2. Data collection methods 57

3.7.2.1. Participant observation..... 57

3.7.2.2. Field notes 62

3.7.2.3. In-depth semi-structured interviews 63

3.7.2.4. Document analysis..... 66

3.7.2.5. Reflective journals..... 68

3.7.3. Data analysis 69

3.7.3.1. Becoming familiar with data 72

3.7.3.2. Generating initial codes..... 73

3.7.3.3. Searching for themes..... 73

3.7.3.4. Reviewing themes..... 74

3.7.3.5. Defining and naming themes 75

3.7.3.6. Producing the report..... 76

3.7.4. Trustworthiness 76

3.7.5. Ethical considerations..... 78

3.7.5.1. Informed consent and public notice 79

3.7.5.2. Harm and risk..... 80

3.7.5.3. Privacy, confidentiality and anonymity 80

3.7.5.4. Storage of data 81

Conclusion	81
CHAPTER FOUR	
RESEARCH FINDINGS	82
Introduction	82
ST 1. CPMG Innovation: Is it evident?	86
Theme 1.1. Seeds of innovation	86
1.1.1. Guidelines for nursing practice	86
1.1.2. Lack of receptivity for change.....	90
1.1.3. Resources for the management of pain	91
Theme 1.2. CPMG: Stimulus for changes	93
1.2.1. Hospital accreditation	93
1.2.2. Changes in leadership, changes in practice	96
Theme 1.3. CPMG: “We don’t know much about it.”.....	96
ST 2. Nurses’ usual practice for managing cancer pain	98
Theme 2.1. Recognition of cancer pain	98
2.1.1. Initiating nursing care: Use of greetings in pain assessment.....	99
2.1.2. Looking for cues and inferences relating to pain	100
2.1.3. Patients’ experience and knowledge: Misconceptions and negative perceptions.....	102
2.1.4. Patients’ preferences for doctors, not nurses	105
2.1.5. Nurses’ misconceptions, misperceptions, and lack of knowledge	106
Theme 2.2. Nurses’ responses and actions on recognition of pain.....	108
2.2.1. Inadequate or limited assessment.....	109
2.2.2. Influence of beliefs on inappropriate responses	110
2.2.3. Pain assessment tools: Various and selective use and interpretation	112
Theme 2.3. Making decisions about pain management.....	115
2.3.1. Reliance on pharmacological interventions	115
2.3.2. Non-pharmacological interventions: Limited use	117
2.3.3. Influential factors on decision-making	118
2.3.3.1. Excessive workload limiting quality nursing care	119
2.3.3.2. Nurses’ attitudes and assumptions	121
2.3.3.3. Non-redeemable nursing activities	122
2.3.3.4. Lack of patient education on pain management	123
2.3.3.5. Inadequate education for nurses on pain management.....	124
Theme 2.4. Evaluation of nursing actions: Guess work and minimal practice	126
Theme 2.5. The dynamics: Family, MO and the nurse	127

2.5.1. Family: Helpful/unhelpful.....	128
2.5.2. Medical hierarchy and medical dominance	130
2.5.3. Desire and reality: The dilemma for nurses.....	134
2.5.4. Negative workplace behaviours among nurses.....	137
Theme 2.6. Roles and functions of nurses in usual practices for managing cancer pain	139
ST 3. Nurses' experiences of managing cancer pain	142
Theme 3.1. Professional dissonance: Undervaluing nursing actions.....	143
Theme 3.2. Sense of powerlessness and frustration: Therapeutic intent vs patient outcomes	145
Theme 3.3. Anger and failure to embrace unique characteristics of patients	147
Theme 3.4. Incongruence reflected in the professional mirror.....	149
Conclusion	152
CHAPTER FIVE	
DISCUSSION and CONCLUSION	154
Introduction	154
5.1. Issues related to Guidelines and Organisation.....	157
5.1.1. The medically driven guidelines as EBGs	159
5.1.2. The organisation: Supporting nurses by providing sufficient resources and improving workplace culture	164
5.2. Issues related to Nurses and Patients/Families	172
5.2.1. Nurses and their practice in cancer pain management.....	174
5.2.1.1. Valuing the nursing contribution.....	174
5.2.1.2. Inadequately managed cancer pain: A cause of suffering for both patients and nurses	179
5.2.2. Call for patient-family centred care: Aligned to therapeutic partnership and mutual respect.....	183
5.3. Final Statement of the Thesis	190
5.3.1. Recommendations for practice development in nursing	194
5.3.2. Recommendations for further research	199
5.3.3. Limitations of the study	200
5.4. Final Reflections on the Study.....	200
REFERENCES.....	205
Appendices	221
Appendix 2.1. Review list of guidelines for cancer pain management	221
Appendix 2.2. Appraisal for cancer pain management related guidelines using AGREE II.....	222
Appendix 2.3. Summary of literature reviewed.....	223

Appendix 3.1. <i>Standard attributes of innovation (Greenhalgh et al., 2008; Healthcare Improvement Scotland, 2013b)</i>	229
Appendix 3.2. <i>Aspects of adopters and the adoption process (Greenhalgh et al., 2008)</i>	229
Appendix 3.3. <i>Vision, strategies and core values of the study setting</i>	230
Appendix 3.4. <i>Demographic characteristics of RNs</i>	231
Appendix 3. 5. <i>Details and contents of education</i>	232
Appendix 3.6. <i>Information letter</i>	233
Appendix 3.7. <i>Recruitment poster</i>	240
Appendix 3.8. <i>Consent form- Nurses</i>	241
Appendix 3.9. <i>Information statement-Patient/family</i>	243
Appendix 3.10. <i>Consent form- Patient/family</i>	247
Appendix 3.11. <i>Nursing research notice</i>	249
Appendix 3.12. <i>Socio-demographic questionnaire</i>	250
Appendix 3. 13. <i>Interview schedule</i>	253
Appendix 3.14. Sample reflective journal	254
Appendix 3.15. <i>Audit trail of the analysis process</i>	255
Appendix 3.15.1. <i>Sample transcription of interview data (Korean-English)</i>	255
Appendix 3.15.2. <i>Process of coding and developing themes</i>	256
Appendix 3.15.3. <i>Critical Incident Technique</i>	259
Appendix 3.16. <i>Ethics approval- HREC</i>	261
Appendix 3.17. <i>Ethics approval- DHUMC IRB</i>	264
Appendix 3.18. <i>Letter of confirmation</i>	266
Appendix 3. 19. <i>A promise of confidentiality agreement form for the transcriptionist</i>	267
Appendix 4.1. <i>Superordinate themes, themes and subordinate themes of the findings</i>	268
Appendix 4.2. <i>Comparison of the contents of the CPMG and the current nursing practice</i>	270

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1. Literature Search and Selection Process	24
Figure 3.1. A Conceptual Model for the Spread and Sustainability of Innovations in Service Delivery	47
Figure 4.1. RNs' Experiences with Cancer Pain Management	143
Figure 5.1. The Implementation of the CPMG (Modified from Greenhalgh et al., 2008)	157
Figure 5.2. Nursing Practice in Managing Pain for Patients with Cancer (Modified from Dowding et al., 2016)	173
Figure 5.3. Integrated Approach to Evidence-Based Cancer Pain Management	193

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1. Inclusion & Exclusion Criteria for Literature Search	25
Table 3.1. Cancer Care Units	53

Table 3.2. Applying Multiple Lenses to Shed Light on Dimensions of Pain Experiences and Management	70
Table 3.3. Steps of Analysis	71
Table 3.4. Eight Elements for Achieving Quality in Qualitative Study	76
Table 4.1. Outline of Themes	84
Table 5.1. Summary of Issues and Implications	192
Table 5.2. A Paradigmatic Shift in Korean Nurses' Approaches to Pain Management; Implications for Education and Practice (Modified from McMillan, 1985; Watson, 1982)	203

Abbreviations

The following abbreviations have been used throughout the thesis.

AACPMGWP	Australian Adult Cancer Pain Management Guideline Working Panel
ACS	American Cancer Society
AGC	Advanced Gastric Cancer
AGREE	Appraisal of Guideline for Research and Evaluation
AN(s)	Assistant Nurse(s)
APS	American Pain Society
CE	Critical Ethnography
CANO	Canadian Association of Nurses in Oncology
CCNS	Cancer Care Nova Scotia
CIHR	Canadian Institute of Health Research
CIT	Critical Incident Technique
CPMG	Cancer Pain Management Guideline
DHUMC	Daehan University Medical Centre
DON	Director of Nursing
ED	Emergency Department
EBG(s)	Evidence-based guideline(s)
EBP	Evidence-based practice
EMR	Electronic Medical Record
ENR	Electronic Nursing Record
FLACC	Face-Legs-Activity-Cry-Consolability Scale
GS	General Surgery
HIRAS	Health Insurance Review and Accreditation Service
HIS	Healthcare Improvement Scotland
IARC	International Agency for Research on Cancer
IASP	International Association for the Study of Pain
ICN	International Council of Nurses
IRB	Institutional Review Board
JCI	Joint Commission International
KCSG	Korean Cancer Study Group
KSHPC	Korean Society for Hospice and Palliative Care
LCI	Long-term Care Insurance
MA	Medical Aid
MHW	Ministry of Health and Welfare
MMAT	Mixed Methods Appraisal Tool
MO	Medical officer
MTX	Methotrexate
NCC	National Cancer Center
NCCI	National Cancer Control Institute
NCCN	National Comprehensive Cancer Network
NCI	National Cancer Institute
NE	Nurse Educator
NHI	National Health Insurance
NHIC	National Health Insurance Corporation
NHIS	National Health Insurance Service
NIPS	Newborn Infant Pain Scale
NP(s)	Nurse Practitioner(s)
NPIs	Non-pharmacological interventions
NRS	Numeric Pain Rating Scale
NUM(s)	Nurse Unit Manager(s)
NTGB	Nursing Task Guidebook
O	Objective data
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
ONS	Oncology Nurses Society
P	Plan
PAFS	Pain Affect Faces Scale
PCA(s)	Patient Controlled Analgesics

PCC	Patient centred care
PCN	Percutaneous Nephrolithotomy
PI	Principle Investigator
PMIS	Pain Management Information Sheet
PRN	Pro re nata
PQRST	position, quality, relieving or aggravating factors, severity and timing
PS	Plastic Surgery
RISS	Research and Information Sharing Service
RN	Registered Nurse
SIGN	Scottish Intercollegiate Guidelines Network
ST	Superordinate theme
TRAM	Transverse rectus abdominis myocutaneous
UN	United Nation
WHO	World Health Organisation

Key to transcripts

The following abbreviations and conventions have been used throughout the thesis, where excerpts from the participants' transcripts have been used.

Names	Pseudonyms are used to refer to participants. The only true name within the data is the researcher's
<i>Indented italic text</i>	Indicates excerpts from the participants transcripts
...	Indicates a pause contained in the original material
...//...	Material edited from the original for clarity
[square brackets]	Researcher's comments, added to provide clarity or explanation
Bold	Indicates a word, phrase, or sentence relevant to theme(s)
(Name and/or TL/TC/TM and/or A-VII-20)	Indicates the location of the excerpts

ABSTRACT

Given cancer causes pain and suffering impacting the quality of life of patients the use of evidence-based guidelines (EBGs) for pain management is essential for improving patient experiences. The Cancer Pain Management Guideline (CPMG) in South Korea was introduced in 2004 following many concerns of healthcare professionals, including nurses, about the suffering of patients with cancer due to pain. South Korean healthcare professionals believed that the introduction of the CPMG would influence the care and treatment of patients with cancer pain.

This study aims to critically explore the impact of the introduction of the CPMG on clinical practice of the nurses in cancer care facilities. Further, the study aimed to uncover the roles and functions of nurses and the factors that influenced or hindered the adoption/spread/uptake of the CPMG.

To answer the research question '*What is the impact of the introduction of the Cancer Pain Management Guidelines on nursing practice in South Korea healthcare context?*' Critical Ethnography was deemed the most appropriate methodology, because it allowed the researcher to observe the practice, examine documents, explore reports on experiences and critically examine the emergent themes from the storylines provided by the 10 nurse participants working in acute cancer care units in South Korea.

A total of 13 themes were classified into three superordinate themes and some themes contained further subordinate themes, which included themes relating to the uptake of the CPMG, nurses' usual practices and the nurses' experiences of managing pain.

There was little evidence of the impact of the introduction of the CPMG on nursing practice. The findings also revealed that nurses' usual practice was observed as 'transactional' and not always demonstrating an advanced level of decision-making informing practice to serve the patients' true needs based on evidence. Nurses themselves were not evaluating their own practice and embracing a comprehensive set of roles and functions related to pain management. Nursing practice was influenced by various issues in terms of nurses' decision-making. These included: 1) the medically driven nature of the development processes for a set of guidelines suitable for use as EBGs; 2) an absence of evidence of the organisation's role in support of EBGs and subsequent support for quality care and a supportive work culture; 3) the valuing of the nursing contribution, and an apparent undermining of the nurses' role by all involved; and 4) lack of patient-family centred care aligned with the concept of a therapeutic partnership and mutual respect.

Recommendations include the need for an integrated approach at four levels: Policy informing the national guidelines; organisational support for implementation of EBGs; involvement of nurses in the EBP through the use of EBGs; and recognition of patients and families' involvement in education and decision-making about their care.

